Town of Falmouth
Fire-EMS Department
8 Bucknam Road
Falmouth, ME 04105
Business 207-781-2610
Fax 207-699-5268

INTEROFFICE MEMORANDUM

TO: Nathan Poore, Town Manager
FROM: Chief Howard Rice, Falmouth Fire-EMS
CC: Peter McHugh, Finance Director
DATE: June 6, 2016
RE: Proposed Purchase of Replacement Pumper and Tower

Falmouth Fire-EMS has recently completed a formal bid process for a replacement pumper for our 2001 Fire Engine (currently Engine 4) and 1999 Tower (Tower 2). A formal bid request was sent out to 6 vendors (E-One, Pierce, Sutphen, Ferrara, KME, and Seagrave) on April 17th and on May 18th we held a public bid opening and received 2 proposals from 1 vendor.

In our bid specification we stated that we were looking for an engine (pumper) with nearly identical specifications to our two fire engines purchased in 2011 and 2013. The only minor difference from the 2013 trucks was the removal of the upper storage (called coffin storage) on the back body of the truck. The trucks purchased in 2011 and 2013 have worked very well for the department and having three engines with the same chassis, motor, transmission, etc. would allow operators to easily train on all three trucks. Currently, with different makes and models of engines, operators have to train on each truck separately.

We also stated that we were looking for a 95-foot platform aerial tower truck that would replace our current 95-foot platform aerial tower truck. The only differences between the proposed new truck and the current truck are that we are now looking for a mid-mount aerial truck and we want a pump on this truck. The current one is rear mount and we feel a mid-mount truck would be more versatile in many of the rural areas of town and also for the commercial buildings. The main difference in the two styles is that with a mid-mount you drive up to the building and with a rear mount you often need to back in to the driveway to obtain maximum reach. The pump requested will make the truck much more versatile as it can supply itself with water if needed. Currently, our tower truck does not have a pump and must always have a pump dedicated with it if it is being used to spray water. In keeping with our recent trend to do more with less, we think we should take advantage of this capability.

Review Process:

Only 1 vendor provided a bid for the 2016 Engine and Tower. We did hear from a vendor that stated: "The last two trucks you have purchased were produced by Sutphen and you have expressed confidence in the Sutphen brand. We chose to bid both of those trucks and if my notes are accurate were lower in cost on both trucks than Sutphen. At the time you chose the higher bid truck for your department. We have not changed in the ensuing time, we still are selling E-One and operating a service center in Brunswick, we would expect to be low bid again based on national trends and bid results of E-One vs. Sutphen. We are very reluctant to bid for two reasons; #1 The process of

bidding takes many hours of staff time, at the dealership and factory level. We must justify this use of resources that could easily approach 100 hours for these two trucks. #2 Based on history with Falmouth allocating these resources appears to be fruitless, history tells us the outcome will be Sutphen." He went on to say: "I would suggest that you explore HGACBUY.ORG or a similar program that would help you avoid the locally derived bid process and help you get the trucks you really want."

I did ask the Sutphen vendor how much time they spent on the bid and was told it took them about a week's worth of work to compile it. There are so many features plus drawings that need to be made to produce each bid.

With only 1 bid received for both the engine and the tower we looked at the costs of recent engines and aerials (towers) purchased in our area as well as the costs of similar trucks if purchased through the HGAC or MAPC group bid programs. The HGAC and MAPC are cooperative purchasing programs that municipalities can join to obtain group pricing on fire apparatus (and other equipment). HGAC is Houston-Galveston Area Council and MAPC is Metropolitan Area Planning Council out of Metro Boston, MA. I have talked to departments in the past that have explored using these as well.

The bids shown below for the HGAC and MAPC engines are hard to compare to our bid since many of the base models shown have a smaller pump capacity and tank size than we bid, nor do they have several other options that we requested. For example, we desire larger capacities due to our rural nature where we often have no water source nearby and have to truck water in and sometimes pump it long distances to the fire. We also have commercial areas where maximum gallons per minute are needed due to heavy fire loads. Our engines all have 1,500 gallon per minute pumps and carry 1,000 gallons on water, have a generator, cord reel with electrical junction box, light tower, 450HP engine, foam system, and LED lights. These features alone added nearly $50,000 to our bid from Sutphen. Other smaller desired options like turtle tile in all compartments, pull out tool trays, tool mounting boards, deck gun, winch, flash lights, etc. add up as well.

Sutphen bid the exact make and model as the engine we purchased in 2011 and again in 2013 with the minor changes requested. The proposal is basically a stock Series S2 model truck, with our requests of a generator, winch, foam system, electric cord reel, and light tower added in. It was the practice in 2016 just as it was in 2011 and 2013 to not purchase a fire engine that has many customized parts specific to Falmouth. We wanted a stock truck with the add-ons. The Sutphen Series S2 stock truck is used by cities across the country such as Hartford, CT. The price for the Sutphen model with all of our requested options is $ 445,931.

New Engines have been purchased in our area in the following communities: Old Orchard Beach, Freeport, South Portland, Windham, Scarborough, Westbrook, Poland, and Fort Kent.

Department	**Vendor**	**Cost**	**When Purchased**
Old Orchard Beach	Sutphen	$ 392 thousand	On Order
South Portland	Pierce	$ 480 thousand	On Order
Scarborough	Smeal	$ 573 thousand	On Order
Windham	Pierce	$ 438 thousand	On Order
Freeport	Pierce	$ 643 thousand	On Order
Poland	Pierce	$ 440 thousand	2015
Fort Kent	Sutphen	$ 489 thousand	2015
Westbrook	Pierce	$ 439 thousand	2015

The following prices for base models of Engines were found through HGAC pricing:

Vendor	Cost
E-One	$ 439, 881
Seagraves	$ 438,944
Smeal	$ 389,973
Ferrara	$ 404,003
Pierce	$ 487,569

The following prices for base models of Engines were found on the MAPC pricing:

Vendor	Cost
Smeal	$ 489,796
Ferrara	$ 438,736
Spartan	$ 432,818
E-One	$ 419,437

The tower bid was a mid-mount stock 95-foot tower-ladder truck with a cord reel added. There are no other customized requests. The same model truck is used in cities across the country such as Hartford, CT, and Syracuse, NY. The cost of the S95 is $990,802. If the tower is ordered at the same time as the engine, we would receive a discount of $20,000, making the cost of the tower $970,802. Sutphen has also priced out other discounts that will be given based on the timing of payments.

The bids shown below for the HGAC and MAPC aerial platforms compare well to our bid since we bid a base model tower truck with very little customization (an electric cord reel).

Platform aerials have also been purchased recently in the following communities: Old Orchard Beach, Biddeford, Augusta, Salem, NH, Auburn, MA, Hyannis, MA, Westbrook, CT, Hartford, CT, and Syracuse, NY. The costs are below:

Department	Vendor	Cost	When Purchased
Old Orchard Beach	Sutphen	$ 1.195 million	May 2016
Biddeford	E-One	$ 951 thousand	December 2012
Augusta	Smeal	$ 1 million	On Order Now
Salem, NH	Sutphen	$ 1.17 million	January 2016
Auburn, MA	Sutphen	$ 945 thousand	May 2014
Hyannis, MA	Pierce	$ 1.29 million	On Order Now
Westbrook, CT	Seagrave	$ 1.29 million	2015
Hartford, CT	Sutphen	$ 988 thousand	December 2014
Syracuse, NY	Sutphen	$ 1.198 million	On Order Now

The following prices for base models of Towers were found through HGAC pricing:

Vendor	Cost
E-One	$ 999,076
Spartan	$ 964,172
Smeal	$ 1,067,939
Ferrara	$ 1,017,708

The following prices for base models of Towers were found on the MAPC pricing:

Vendor	Cost
Smeal	$ 1,076,299
Ferrara	$ 1,043,775
Pierce	$ 1,058,068
E-One	$ 1,027,786

Recommendation:

After comparing the proposals plus reviewing recent engine and aerial tower purchases in the area, and the base prices through two cooperative buying programs, Falmouth Fire-EMS wishes to purchase both the 2016 Engine and 2016 Tower at this time from Sutphen. The prices would be $ 445,931 for the engine and $ 970,802 for the tower. This reflects a savings of $20,000 due to purchasing two trucks from the vendor.

This engine would be the exact match for our current Engine 1 and Engine 2 which we have all been extremely pleased with since they arrived. It is unusual to find a department where there is 100% approval for a new fire engine as many firefighters have their preferences. Since we purchased either engine I still have not heard any complaints about them. We have also received positive feedback from our town mechanics who work on the Sutphen engines for us as well as the vendor who performs our annual pump testing and maintenance. I think a nearly exact duplicate makes sense in terms of recent member satisfaction and positive history, and also with the layout. It has been a goal for the past few years to streamline all of our fire apparatus so that they carry similar tools in similar locations. With this new truck, the tools on Engine 1, Engine 2, and Engine 4 could be in the exact same place. This would make it much easier for firefighters who use all three trucks.

The CIP has a budget of $465,000 for the engine and a budget of $1 million for the tower. Purchasing both trucks under budget will bring a savings of $20,000 for the engine and $30,000 for the tower, **plus** any revenue received from the trade-ins of both apparatus.

Conclusion:

The Sutphen Series S2 engine proposal meets all of our desired needs and we feel that it will serve the Town of Falmouth well for the next 20 years. It has the versatility to perform as Engine 4 covering nearly half of the Town of Falmouth in our rural areas and future growth areas of Route 100. We have kept the truck short in length so that it fits in all of our stations, including Station 1. This is important as we commonly rotate the trucks around as needed to back up each station. When Engine 1 is out for maintenance, Engine 4 routinely covers for it.

The Sutphen S95 tower proposal also meets all of our needs and we feel will help us protect the commercial area of our town plus residential houses for the next 20 years. So much of our recent growth has been in taller buildings (ex. Blueberry Commons, 75 Clearwater Drive, etc.). I recommend purchasing the Sutphen Engine and Sutphen Tower for $ 445,931 and $ 970,802, respectively.